

First Half Facilitation Note Jennifer Ingham typed by Emma Miranda Fenby on 8/12/13 at Royal Commission request of 8/12/13

Facilitation 27/05/2013

24/5/13

Please note the following:

MS: Michael Salmon
 CW: Christopher Wallace
 Peter: Peter Kelso
 JI: Jennifer Ingham
 EF: Emma Fenby

Michael Salmon, Facilitator, Claimant Jennifer Ingham

MS: Sister with JI, and Alison Reihart, best friend support person + husband + solicitor. Not easy. Solicitor seems ok. Pastorally oriented. JI pleasant, hurt lady clearly. Really significant meeting for her. They made point meeting has to work today. She has old scars on her wrists, showed me. She said she lived with Rex Brown. Major points.

(a) What did Church know and when, was there a cover up. I told them we can discuss. Told them we Diocese through Chris will do best he can. They think moved around.

Chris Wallace moved b/c **[because]** alcohol abuse. MS Sister said that he was moved because people knew. I made pt **[point]** while lot of media attention about cover up but my experience is not so much. They understand evidence of prior knowledge of her. At meeting and others there.

CW: Rex Brown already removed and retired 1990. No recorded at any meeting with JI. Only knew of boys

MS: also [REDACTED]

CW: they didn't believe [REDACTED]. I did.

EF: we accept her and meeting her

CW: Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** reacted the way he expected.

EF: accepted complaint

CW: ask who else there

MS: b/w **[between]** Bishop and here

MS: upset Bishop is not here, they thought b/c **[because]** frail

EF: incorrect

MS sister said she lives in Lismore and he is not frail. They feel let down b/c **[because]** meeting so important to JI, Bishop should be here. I went into Chris chancellor, 2IC to Bishop. She has read your CV, police life, married with kids, real world background and experiences and meeting Bishop 24/6/13. Sense Bishop not here JI is frail. Third thing lawyer seems reasonable, but he wants Church to be very generous pastorally and financially. I talked about meeting being flexible. They said maybe numbers first. Lawyer seems ok. He'll bat hard for client. He might be a Catholic. He is not antagonistic. Decent demeanour. They were uptight @ beginning, better now, a bit more relaxed. Is for her she wants, Rex Brown living rent free in her mind all these years. Concern about cover up and knowledge is a big issue, need to deal with it. Give due regard.

EF: we have to be open and honest about what we knew and when.

- CW: can ask who else at meeting
- EF: yes other than Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. They said other people there. Can make enquires.
- MS: not just JI, husband, sister
- CW: all dealing with mother, fact she knew one did nothing.
- MS: said JI can talk about her life, doesn't have to go over allegation but can. Where they also look at there sense of suicide attempts.
- Never any pastoral follow up. Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**, none
- EF: there wasn't follow up and should have been. Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** didn't know what to do by the sounds of it and now can't recall.
- CW that's right
- MS not that far back. . My advice, can't say moved for reasons other than alcohol. But don't defend what we can't, Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. No follow through
- EF yes, can't defend.
- MS: yes. Important to get over line. Fragile, very fragile. Lady can see pain in her face
- EF good report
- MS yes

Open Session

- MS: get rolling, gone through the preliminaries with you. Underline point. Toward Healing meeting all about JI. Hope outcomes for healing, understand healing is a journey. (EF out of room to get people quieten down) **[The meeting room was right near reception at Mullins lawyers, the receptionist was having a conversation we could hear with another person, I left the room and asked them to keep their voices down]**. Diocese accepts your complaint. Often the case in these meetings. A good starting point, if you want to JI, say anything you can to Deacon Chris. I understand there is an issue in Bishop not being here. Also a issue about knowledge of Rex Brown and that these are two issues that you want to discuss. You can also talk about what it has been like, abuse effects you and your family. I turn over to you. Chris will answer as best he can.
- PK are you ok.
- JI don't know where to start. How I started this. I turned 50 last year. Taken me until last year to realise how hard I have worked to get mentally well. Then I get newspaper articles from my aunty about Fr Brown. Just articles, her message, I knew I needed to be set free. So black inside me. You read my report. I worked so hard. During the interview. I'm JI, I'm really lucky to be alive. Alison and Lindsay with me when I did contact officer interview. Fr Brown @ my first wedding. I've never understood why I did that all this therapy. I forgave myself last year for that, how much power, I understood not my fault. When I spoke to Fr Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** in 1990 I admitted abuse, he told me he already knew about me and he named two others. I thought a good thing he told me but I carried it around. So much self loathing and hate.
- Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: made her his sex slave.
- JI I kept the secret to protect my parents, family, such a hold on me. To be able to ? forgive myself. Start of my journey. Why didn't Priest look after me. I don't understand that. I was so les important. They protected themselves not me. I need to be set free of all that. I want to look the Bishop in the eye that the Church ?

CW if did we I can tell you that

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: We expect that the Church is very, very generous in compensating JI.

CW I don't think you can compensate. I can't understand it, not normal human response. Fr Brown pretended to be dedicated to service of others, he served himself. It's wrong, what he did was wrong. What wasn't done by the Church was wrong. Apology a weak sort of word, not enough, but nothing I don't think will ever be enough. As much as myself or the Bishop can say to you the Church is sorry for what happened and what didn't. Forgive yourself, not your fault. Actually nothing you need to forgive yourself for. You did nothing wrong. I came into the Diocese from Police, Chancellor 2005, when got your file, your complaint, I read it and thought genuine case and the truth Pat Mullins asked me does the Diocese want to investigate. I said no, we accept, had some record in 2005. We will accept everything you say as the truth. We wanted to move this along for you as you have suffered enough. I am glad to meet you, I am glad I am here to tell you about how I felt, I accept what you say happens is the truth. A couple of things you are wondering about, fragile Bishop. Not the case.

JI Not the case

CW: Bishop had a large mass

Sister: should be priest.

CW: as a Deacon I understand that.

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: shouldn't have delegated

Peter: you have authority from Bishop today.

Chris: confirmation and mass etc. short notice thrown him, he would like to be here. I have done this before the Bishops. He will meet you. That's why I am here. I apologise.

Peter: Can I suggest a hand written letter

Sister: Bernadette Rodgers implied too old and frail. How much importance.

MS: point you made about why they would do that to you. Archbishop Hart Victorian inquiry, complex story, different times people in the church have looked after the Church. No doubt Church not always covered in glory. People often made decisions we look after Church but victims are church. Therein is part of the answer. We can only hope learnings and a better church come out of it

CW: culture change, I look @ being in the Police. The way things done in the past wasn't good enough. Same when I came into the Church. There needed to be a change, right back to Rome. Cannon law, 1983, very inadequate penal section now under review and cardinal admitted grossly inadequate. Another point about Brown, when I came into job, I came out of another Diocese I came into the Diocese to look after my parents. I became Chancellor, I became the liaison with Police, ombudsman, all child protection in the Diocese. Part of my brief as Chancellor I had to rely on records, not talked about with Brown, removed from Tweed Heads because alcohol abuse. Moved finally because of alcohol abuse. Brown appealed to Rome and Rome upheld Bishop. Not about his abuse. I know in early 1980s have some boys staying with him, they stole from him, they claimed he had child pornography. He was convicted in Qld Mags Crt **[Queensland Magistrates Court]**. First we knew about mid 1980's. Meeting of Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** no record of it. I accept it took place and I accept what you said. Bishop spoke to Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** and he can't recall it.

JI: Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** went to school with my father. I waitressed for him

CW: he remembered your father

Sister: Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** – not remember meeting or JI

CW: both

Jl: appalling, he was at my father's funeral.

CW: if they knew about the abuse and other girls I have no records, nothing in them. Yours was a surprise. Bishop said he thought only Brown and boys. I believe you. I apologise nothing down **[done]**. Why nothing down **[done]**, not excusable, culture thing, lack of power under cannon law, culture didn't want to know or didn't want to deal with it. I was thinking about my kids, discipline but still loved them. I don't think the senior clergy knew how to discipline without loving them. I don't think they were ever charged to deal with this by the church or their lives without families. Going through a culture change. Doesn't excuse it. Help why not do it.

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: cowards. At any of day, persons of God letting a child be abused. Cannon law neither here nor there.

Peter: Church meant to be the safest place to have children.

Husband: even when you came back.

MS: we were talking and Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]** was appalling response.

Sister: Jl waitress at a restaurant, a real relationship, not just a parishioner. I am appalled he is denying knowing Jl.

CW: Said he doesn't recall.

Jl: Re-enforces the lie. I was living funded by someone, expensive psych unit in Sydney. He'd fly me to presbytery, other young boys smokes, other priests, I was sleeping downstairs with Brown. They all new me I would go there often. Young vulnerable girl. He'd fly me there and abuse would continue all the time in private hospital. All got him on drunk to much and pornography.

Husband: looked into it!

CW: we accepted it. Investigation cross ?

Husband: who paid for it.

CW: I assume Brown.

Peter: generous to accept that. We Frank Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. Accept took place. What happens to him.

CW: retired.

Peter: reserve bench?

CW: Yes. Not in our Diocese

Peter: beyond reach. Another meeting 1993?

CW: out of our Diocese.

MS: CW can have another meeting with Mulgrave, **[Mulcahy]** nothing file listening. We all sit here knowing not a good look around Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**.

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: evidence that Jl telling truth.

CW: we accept that.

Peter: yes.

MS: the sense of injustice for JI a person implicit in detriment you suffered. Daughters at a school mate, you waitress saying can't recall you and meeting incredible sense of justice, like a non person. Cared little then or now. We can't make him learn or remember. Robust discussion to take into any level of decency. Report each when you meet with Bishop.

Peter: CW understand that?

CW: yes

MS: irrespective of Mulgrave, **[Mulcahy]** as this went forward CW is sitting he saying the Diocese believe JI, not Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. To that extent he doesn't count.

JI: incredibly important.

MS: no ambiguity about that.

Peter: you put well MS.

JI: I have tried to justify it. Important to me. My life could have been completely different, a whole lot different. Someone had just stopped Brown [broke down] 20 years ago if some had helped me. Rather than me being resilient, to live, watched family torn apart. My friends like Ali, my husband, my daughter, my daughter's Dad. They helped me but it been hard work.

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: fights every day to stay alive.

JI: make sure you hammer home how hard it has been. Everyday I have to pretend I'm fine, make a pretence I'm fine. Hard work, I wanted to return to church for my daughter. I tried really hard for her. I was told "it is ok JI, you'll come back to the church when you're ready". But is taken hard work, sorry, it is hard work.

CW: church should come back to you not other way round.

JI: so tired, so hard work, so trying, having to lie about Brown. I am a smart intelligent women I want that rent free space filled up, I want my family put back together. Did you read about my mother?

CW: yes.

JI: hold on b/c **[because]** a cultural thing.

Sister: our aunty a Presentation Sister did you know CW?

CW: no.

Sister: aunty taught in Lismore 1970, missionary in PNG till 2000.

MS: anything Diocese can say and do to your mum?

Sister: don't go there.

JI: mum 74 years.

Husband: in denial.

JI: protected the church. I was frightened he'd say something about me. Painful mum didn't protect me. Painful. Let her be, she knows she has down **[done]** wrong thing.

MS: in these meetings, people like a written apology to hang onto. You if you choose could show your mum. Would the church writing to you be helpful.

CW: consider for a while.

MS: don't have to decide now.

Jl: yes.

MS: break?

Sister: coffee.

Jl: thank-you believing me CW, believing CW.

CW: can see it is what you ?

Break

[EF out of the venue to purchase coffee for all participants, prior to purchasing coffee rang Alex Kohn at Makinson & d'Apice lawyers. Out of the venue for approximately 30 minutes]

MS: see where we are:

1. CW: full and frank with Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. Don't know outcome. We hope it is validating back for you.

Jl: it is. My mother converted to Catholicism to marry my father. She has her faith. My mom's husband Jack told her to have a scan. They heard voices and mum acted strange. Jack said Fr Mulgrave **[Mulcahy]**. Would you like to say hello. Mum said no. Jack surprised.

MS: 2. Diocese something in writing?

Jl: yes.

MS: by time you meet with Bishop on 24/6/13

Jl: yes.

MS: anything else you want to say, questions.

Jl: do I believe in God, do I not? I hate beginning **[being]** inside a church. I grew up being Catholic. Life revolved around it. Funeral of a brother next door neighbour, I was late, so I was ushered up front. Service similar to Catholic service, Anglican. I cried all the way through. I have no understanding if I will get it back, faith. I don't know how that happen.

CW: faith is a grace it comes from God. I wonder whether lost or painted over. I think more likely with you. You haven't lost it, just ? over it that you can't see it. Removal of that dirt what has to happen. Hopefully today the start of it.

MS: TH **[Towards Healing]** core business. ? , sad outcome in these case. All work out where we stand with the church. Tragic when Brown makes decisions for Jl. Your birth right to go into the church. Your choice, your journey. Brown made your journey, no right. Moving forward, it with appropriate reconciliation. Contact pt **[point]** Jl to engage with. So feels can walk in a church, let her make up her mind.

Jl: needs to be safe, tired lost time. Horrible.

CW: any pets? Working in church I have ? I have some cows, I find I connect to God quickly there and easier than in church.

Jl: blockage, black whole. I was not respected in any capacity, need to feel respected. Important, not left behind Family torn apart. Get it from Ali b/c **[because]** he gets it. Lindsay, hard journey. First marriage broke up as once I acknowledged abuse I pushed him away. Uglier.

Husband: a really nice guy, we are friends. I can't understand why they were divorced. One of Jenny's faults totally no trust (Her futures conspired

Jl: I need that. I forgave myself b/c **[because]** I was protecting everyone else except me. Now hopefully I can, I want that, from you. I want to genuinely feel I am important. You are sorry but I'm not just another number.

CW: I know your story, I am happy ? to you. Till we find someone else. I am willing. I believe you're not a number. I've been in cops, your not a number, if you are comfortable I'm happy.

MS: still see Dr Dorley **[Dooley]**, spiritual direction. About you navigating your journey. If acceptable to you, CW reference pt **[point]** go to mum when you feel the need.

CW: happy for Lindsay to come.

MS: open ended. doesn't matter when, can ring. Does that help.

Jl: yes.

MS: anything else?

End open session

EF: thing we can ? do ? can and can't want treatment. Dignified and respectful.

Peter: treatment, recognition and recompense. Her day. Needs to be set free. Needs that today. CW will do what you can, I know that. High end of scale made Anorexic before abuse. Doely **[Dooley]** has commented on affect and seriousness. Mentioned all other things wouldn't have happened but for Brown. Financial settlement with medical people over that 75% to Brown. Balanced report. Hugh part is economic loss. Every right to expect a uni **[university]** degree and professional degree. Maximum 20 hours per week, all she can do. Rest of her life. Living with Brown in her head rent free in brain, like holding a grudge. Controlled by a dead man. Needs to get him out of the head. Never be free, to live to fill. Loss of faith. We want a significant figure.

EF: a gesture, a significant one, can't compensate for what has happened.

Peter: needs to hit Jl as sounds right. Instinctively feels ok. Feel church's heart and resolve.

Friend **[Alison Reihart]**: brother a surgeon, Father IQ, very intelligent. Need to look after financially.

EF: certainly want her to have treatment. No amount compensate.

Peter: mortgage \$350k. She shouldn't have it. You say what you always do. RC **[Royal Commission]** empowering people, shaking the tree. People, contacting me hardly any money.

EF: important point, however, today is Jl. Helpful to have a figure.

Peter: \$1 million.

Peter: \$380k inclusive # \$200k legal costs! – jaw. Needs ½ million.

- vulnerable
- delicate mental state
- want \$500 k
- lead into process with expectations that church help her to be set free of Rex Brown
- step finalising today and leave here feeling better.
- ACBC **[Australian Catholic Bishops Conference]** limitation period.

Explained MS / CW

MS: no doubt levels of expectations, particularly Ali, girl friend. Beyond bad abuse, sex slave thing, whilst in care. Jaw bit you over well. \$250k all in. Doyle **[Dooley]** a strong report. Long time known. Abuse long + systematic. Feed in to other Catholic culture, mum, linked. Betrayed others. Up to that figure ok. Very significant, generous case. Towards Healing, limited legal costs.

EF: \$250k plus fixed costs.

MS: ? , JI first day in job.

JI moved on from ?

MS: contact with CW.