

John Dalzell
ext-6160
 06/03/2006 02:44 PM

To: "Michael Moore" <mmoore@ado.syd.catholic.org.au>,
 mcasey@ado.syd.catholic.org.au,
 john.usher@ado.syd.catholic.org.au
 cc:
 Subject: Re: Ellis v Pell [2006]

Dear Michael

I forward this for your information only.

Kind regards

John D

----- Forwarded by John Dalzell/Sydney/CORRS/AU on 06/03/2006 02:44 PM -----



MWright@ccinsurances.com.au
 06/03/2006 02:29 PM

To: John.Dalzell@corrs.com.au
 cc: prush@ccinsurances.com.au, JBucci@ccinsurances.com.au
 Subject: Re: Ellis v Pell [2006]

Hello John,

Thankyou very much for your update on this matter. As we discussed on Friday, I am disappointed with the decision, but it is not entirely unexpected. I am in the process of reviewing the judgment, but agree with your recommendations that we should immediately:-

1. Have Cardinal Pell's defence costs agreed or assessed; and
2. Seek Senior Counsel's advice on the prospects of appealing the Plaintiff's successful extension of time against the Trustees.

I would appreciate receiving a copy of Senior Counsel's advice in due course so that we can then consider whether to proceed with an appeal.

Regards

Marita Wright
 National Claims Manager
 Catholic Church Insurances Limited
 Phone: (03) 9934 3070
 Fax: (03) 9934 3462
 E-mail: mwright@ccinsurances.com.au

John.Dalzell@corrs.com.au

03/03/2006 02:57 PM

To: MWright@ccinsurances.com.au
 cc: Paul.McCann@corrs.com.au
 Subject: Ellis v Pell [2006]

Dear Marita

As you know, the judgment in the matter of Ellis was handed down by Associate Justice Patton this afternoon in the Supreme Court. I have attached the full and somewhat voluminous judgment in this matter for your information.

In summary, the following orders were made:

the limitation period against the Trustees of the Roman Catholic Church for the Archdiocese of Sydney is extended until 30 August 2004;

the case against Cardinal Pell is dismissed with costs against the Plaintiff; and

otherwise costs are reserve for further argument on a date to be arranged.

As you will see, the judgment is rather lengthy, however, the following salient points should be noted:

the Court accepted the Plaintiff's evidence as reliable;

there was no basis upon which the cause of action could be maintained against Cardinal Pell, either personally, or by way of a representative order;

the evidence against the Trustees, although equivocal, is enough to produce an arguable case that they were, at all relevant times, the entity which the Archdiocese adopted and put forward as the permanent corporate entity or interface between the spiritual and temporal sides of the Church legally responsible for the acts and omissions of the Archbishop and his subordinates; and

at all material times, the Plaintiff knew of the acts of Fr Duggan on which his cause of action is founded and that they had caused him some personal injury. The Plaintiff was also aware of the identity of the Trustees at all material times.

The Plaintiff's application to extend the limitation period against the Trustees was effectively granted on one point. That point was that it was not until September 2001, in his consultation with the psychoanalyst, Mr Murray, that the Plaintiff had the means of knowledge of the nature and extent of the personal injury caused by the alleged assaults of Fr Duggan. Indeed, the Court held that it was not until some time in 2004, when the effects of the abuse raised grave economic consequences for the Plaintiff, that the Court held he should have recognised the nature and extent of his injury to be a decisive fact and therefore brought the action [see paragraph 80 of the judgment].

Importantly, the Court has tempered the above opinion with the precursor that:

"minds might, I think, legitimately differ as to when it might reasonably be said that the Plaintiff was or should have been aware of the nature and extent of the personal injury inflicted upon him by Fr Duggan".
[my emphasis]

In our opinion, it is this legitimate difference recognised by the Court

and the Court's finding that it was not until September 2001 that the Plaintiff had the means of knowledge of the nature and extent of the personal injury caused by the alleged sexual assaults, which may form the basis of an appeal against this element of the Court's decision and, therefore, the extension of time against the Trustees.

The Court found that although real prejudice to the Defendants could be identified, whether by the death of the Third Defendant or the difficulties in contacting other witnesses, there could still be a fair, albeit not perfect, trial.

We would suggest that the following action should now be taken:

the costs which relate to the defence of the case against Cardinal Pell should be agreed or assessed. We shall endeavour to ensure this is done straight away;

we should seek the immediate advice of senior counsel as to the merits of launching an appeal against the Plaintiff's successful extension of time against the Trustees.

If you have any queries, please contact me on 9210 6160

Kind regards

John Dalzell

(See attached file: Ellis.pdf)

This is an email from Corrs Chambers Westgarth or Corrs Support Services Pty Ltd. The email and any attachments may be confidential, legally privileged and/or subject to copyright. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not disclose or use the information contained in this e-mail. If you have received this email in error, please notify us immediately and delete the email and all copies. We do not guarantee that this email and any attachments are free from virus or other errors. We will not be responsible for loss or damage resulting (either directly or indirectly) from any such virus or error. We will only be responsible for a change to a document if we made the change. The content of and opinions expressed in non-business emails are not necessarily ours. If this is a commercial electronic message within the meaning of the Spam Act, you may indicate that you do not wish to receive any further commercial electronic messages from us by sending an email to <mailto:privacy@corrs.com.au>

This message contains privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the addressee named above. If you are not the intended recipient of this message you are hereby notified that you must not disseminate, copy, or take any action in reliance on it. If you have received this message in error please notify Catholic Church Insurances Limited immediately.

Contact Details:

324 St. Kilda Road, Melbourne, 3004, AUSTRALIA

Telephone - (03) 9934 3000

Facsimile - (03) 9934 3460

Interstate Callers - 1300 655 001

Email - mailsweep@ccinsurances.com.au



Ellis.pdf