

From: MWright@ccinsurances.com.au<MWright@ccinsurances.com.au>

Date Sent: Friday, 31 March 2006 09:24:43

Date Received: Friday, 31 March 2006 09:24:03

To: John.Dalzell@corrs.com.au<John.Dalzell@corrs.com.au>

CC: Michael Casey</O=FIRST ORGANIZATION/OU=FIRST ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=MCASEY>; John Usher</O=FIRST ORGANIZATION/OU=FIRST ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=JUSHER>

BCC:

Subject: Re: Ellis - Costs

Attachment: None

Hello John,

Thankyou for the update.

I agree with Michael Casey's instructions that we should now proceed to have the Cardinal's costs assessed.

Regards

Marita Wright
National Claims Manager
Catholic Church Insurances Limited
Phone: (03) 9934 3070
Fax: (03) 9934 3462
E-mail: mwright@ccinsurances.com.au

John.Dalzell@corrs.com.au

30/03/2006 12:23 PM

To: mcasey@ado.syd.catholic.org.au, "John Usher" <john.usher@ado.syd.catholic.org.au>, danny.casey@ado.syd.catholic.org.au, mmoore@ado.syd.catholic.org.au
cc: patrick.flynn@banco.net.au, tracey@strategic.net.au, MWright@ccinsurances.com.au, srushton@selbornechambers.com.au, mchugh@banco.net.au
Subject: Ellis - Costs

Dear All

I attended the Supreme Court of New South Wales this morning to receive judgment on the costs argument in the matter of Ellis v Pell & Ors.

In short, his Honour upheld his judgment regarding Cardinal Pell, in that he awarded costs in favour of the Cardinal. In addition, his Honour held that in the circumstances the Cardinal's costs should not be payable until the conclusion of the proceedings.

With regard to the Trustees, his Honour held that the costs of the Notice of Motion should be 'costs in the cause'. In other words, whoever wins

the substantive trial shall be awarded the costs of the limitation hearing.

His Honour also made the following relevant comments:

the plaintiff only had a flimsy basis for joining Cardinal Pell;

I remain of the view that there was no arguable or possible basis for the joinder of Dr Pell;

In my opinion, the conduct of the trustees in defending the Notice of Motion was not unreasonable in the circumstances;

I should emphasise that I did no more than find that there was only an arguable case against the Trustees. Whether the Trustees are in fact liable is a matter for the trial judge.

In my opinion, the effect of his Honour's judgment is twofold:

1. the plaintiff now faces the prospect of preparing his case for trial with no external funding;
2. although costs have been awarded in favour of Cardinal Pell, the fact that these are not payable until the conclusion of the proceedings is, in some ways, advantageous. This element of the judgment saves us from the prospects of enforcing costs and thereby bankrupting the plaintiff at this stage of the proceedings. Whilst some clients would happily bankrupt the opposition without a second thought, I have discussed this with Michael Casey and understand the ramifications that would invariably flow from such an act.

With your instructions, we shall now endeavour to have Cardinal Pell's costs assessed.

Finally, as discussed with Michael Casey this morning, I will ensure that a Holding Summons is filed in the Court of Appeal today. This will have the effect of extending the time by which an ordinary Notice of Appeal should be filed by a period of three months. I have, instructed Counsel to ensure that the grounds of appeal are settled, at the latest, by next week.

If you have any queries please do not hesitate to contact me.

This is an email from Corrs Chambers Westgarth or Corrs Support Services Pty Ltd. The email and any attachments may be confidential, legally privileged and/or subject to copyright. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not disclose or use the information contained in this e-mail. If you have received this email in error, please notify us immediately and delete the email and all copies. We do not guarantee that this email and any attachments are free from virus or other errors. We will not be responsible for loss or damage resulting (either directly or indirectly) from any such virus or error. We will only be responsible for a change to a document if we made the change. The content of and opinions expressed in non-business emails are not necessarily ours. If this is a commercial electronic message within the meaning of the Spam Act, you may indicate that you do not wish to receive any further commercial electronic messages from us by sending an email to <mailto:privacy@corrs.com.au>

This message contains privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the addressee named above. If you are not the intended recipient of this message you are hereby notified that you must not disseminate, copy, or take any action in reliance on it. If you have received this message in error please notify Catholic Church Insurances Limited immediately.

Contact Details:

324 St. Kilda Road, Melbourne, 3004, AUSTRALIA

Telephone - (03) 9934 3000

Facsimile - (03) 9934 3460

Interstate Callers - 1300 655 001

Email - mailsweep@ccinsurances.com.au
