

# COPY

Our ref: JRM:KS:991255  
Direct Line: 3231 8861  
Direct Email: mooregroup@thymac.com.au  
Your ref: Paul Reynolds

21 September 1999

CCI Limited  
GPO Box 180B  
MELBOURNE VIC 3001

Dear Mr Reynolds

Re: The Corporation of the Trustees of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Brisbane -ats- Joan Isaacs

As you know, we act on behalf of The Corporation of the Trustees of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Brisbane. We understand that Laurie Rolls has made you aware of a claim by Joan Isaacs and we understand that CCI is prepared, on a "without prejudice" basis to indemnity, to endeavour to assist with the resolution.

So that your file records are consistent with ours, and so that you may appreciate the present position, we enclose:-

1. A copy of the Claim for Compensation form (7 pages) without all of the attachments. We understand that you have already received the various attachments. If this is not the case, please let us know;
2. A copy of the letter Cranston McEachern wrote to Minter Ellison of 25 May 1999 which similarly provides a list of attachments. If you do not have any of these attachments, please let us know;
3. A copy of the sentencing remarks by Judge Maguire dated 10 December 1998 (Mrs Isaacs appears to be the victim referred to therein);
4. A copy of the Victim Impact Statement of Joan Issacs;
5. A copy of the letter and attachment received from Cranston McEachern dated 10 September 1999 (with attachment);

- 2 -

CCI Limited

21 September 1999

- 
6. A copy of our response to Cranston McEachern dated 14 September 1999;
  7. A copy of our letter to Father Spence of 15 September 1999;
  8. A copy of the letter received from Cranston McEachern dated 15 September 1999;
  9. Our response dated 21 September 1999.

**QBE INSURANCE**

We have not as yet referred this claim to QBE Insurance. Please let us know if you would like us to do so as we appreciate there may be "higher level" discussions between CCI and QBE to try and negotiate some form of common sense arrangement over these matters.

**BRIEF OBSERVATIONS**

In relation to the Isaacs claim, it seems to us we have three (3) choices:-

1. We offer nothing and indicate we will strongly defend because of the various legal and oppression problems we consider the claimant has with respect to any civil claim against the Church. We would not recommend a nominal payment in this instance.
2. We offer a settlement of \$20,000.00 to \$25,000.00 subject to confidentiality.
3. We offer a settlement that embraces the cost of the *Towards Healing* program. In other words, we reimburse the claimant for all medical expenditure relating to psychological counselling to date and we arrive at a compensation figure for future medical counselling and in addition offer the *Towards Healing* services should she wish to partake of them.

Having discussed the matter with Laurie Rolls, even a payment of \$20,000.00 would probably be regarded as nominal or, perhaps, even an affront as against the ambit claim of \$231,000.00 that the claimant's solicitors are advancing. Therefore, option (3) seems to be the most appropriate (or perhaps a mixture of option (2) and (3)).

We must say that our inclination is to try and direct these claims towards option (3) so that it becomes known that pure money claims will, so far as the Church is concerned, be defended and claimants will put their own monetary resources at risk in terms of cost.

**NEXT STEP**

Because this claimant has quite serious psychological issues that she is dealing with, we consider that her need at the moment is to know one way or the other what is to be done. If we are proposing to offer no compensation but to pursue option (3) above, the sooner we can state this specifically the better. Otherwise, we consider the claimant is in a state of anxiety and is anxiously wanting to know what the position is.

- 3 -

CCI Limited

21 September 1999

---

We will send a copy of this letter to Father Spence and would appreciate your input on this matter. We have not sent a copy of this letter to Laurie Rolls and will leave it for you to pass a copy on to him as you consider appropriate.

Yours faithfully

"(Signed) Thynne & Macartney"

Enc